

## **SC Municipal Attorneys Association Annual Meeting**

### ***“Honest Services Fraud” and its non-application in SC Friday, December 9, 2011***

#### **I. What was “Honest Services Fraud”?**

A. As one of several components of a federal mail fraud charge, “scheme or artifice to defraud” is defined at 18 USC 1346 as: “For the purposes of this chapter, the term “scheme or artifice to defraud” includes a scheme or artifice to deprive another of the intangible right of honest services.”

The federal mail fraud charge as written dates back to 1948; however, mail fraud statutes date back to the nineteenth century. Honest services fraud dates only to 1988.

B. Previous case law provided that “‘honest services’ can include honest and impartial government.” *US v. Brumley*, 116 F.3d 728(1997), cert. denied 118 S.Ct. 625.

“Mere violation of a state ethics law, standing alone, does not suffice to establish intent to deprive citizenry of the honest services of a government official, and is thus insufficient to establish a violation of mail fraud statute; something else such as evidence of defendant’s fraudulent intent or defendant’s contemplation of some actual harm or injury is necessary to support conviction.” *US v. Goldberg*, 928 F. Supp. 89(1996).

“The concept of governmental ‘honest services’ in this context eludes easy definition.” *US v. Sawyer*, 85 F.3d 713, 724(1996).

#### **II. What is “Honest Services Fraud” now?**

A series of cases were heard by the US Supreme Court wherein defendants found guilty of honest services fraud appealed their convictions asserting that the definition of honest services fraud was unconstitutionally vague. The public version involves elected or appointed public officials who allegedly have not provided their honest services to their constituents. The Court did not completely gut honest services fraud. The charge when brought against public officials now must include bribery or kickbacks as part of the allegation, not simply that the public official failed to disclose a conflict of interest or self-dealing. The syllabus for *Skilling v. US*, No. 08-1394 is attached.

#### **III. The Ethics Reform Act’s Rules of Conduct**

A. **Section 8-13-100** Various definitions

(3) **'Business'** means a corporation, partnership, proprietorship, firm, an enterprise, a franchise, an association, organization, or a self-employed individual.

(4) **'Business with which he is associated'** means a business of which the person or a member of his immediate family is a director, an officer, owner, employee, a compensated agent, or holder of stock worth one hundred thousand dollars or more at fair market value and which constitutes five percent or more of the total outstanding stock of any class.

(11) (a) **'Economic interest'** means an interest distinct from that of the general public in a purchase, sale, lease, contract, option, or other transaction or arrangement involving property or services in which a public official, public member, or public employee may gain an economic benefit of fifty dollars or more.

(b) This definition does not prohibit a public official, public member, or public employee from participating in, voting on, or influencing or attempting to influence an official decision if the only economic interest or reasonably foreseeable benefit that may accrue to the public official, public member, or public employee is incidental to the public official's public member's, or public employee's position or which accrues to the public official, public member, or public employee as a member of a profession, occupation, or large class to no greater extent than the economic interest or potential benefit could reasonably be foreseen to accrue to all other members of the profession, occupation, or large class.

(15) **'Family member'** means an individual who is:

(a) the spouse, parent, brother, sister, child, mother-in-law, father-in-law, son-in-law, daughter-in-law, brother-in-law, sister-in-law, grandparent, or grandchild;

(b) a member of the individual's immediate family.

(18) **'Immediate family'** means:

(a) a child residing in a candidate's, public official's, public member's, or public employee's household;

(b) a spouse of a candidate, public official, public member, or public employee; or

(c) an individual claimed by the candidate, public official, public member, or public employee or the candidate's, public official's,

public member's, or public employee's spouse as a dependent for income tax purposes.

(20) **'Individual'** means one human being.

(21) **'Individual with whom he is associated'** means an individual with whom the person or a member of his immediate family mutually has an interest in any business of which the person or a member of his immediate family is a director, officer, owner, employee, compensated agent, or holder of stock worth one hundred thousand dollars or more at fair market value and which constitutes five percent or more of the total outstanding stock of any class.

**B. Section 8-13-700.** Use of official position or office for financial gain; disclosure of potential conflict of interest.

(A) No public official, public member, or public employee may knowingly use his official office, membership, or employment to obtain an economic interest for himself, a family member, an individual with whom he is associated, or a business with which he is associated. This prohibition does not extend to the incidental use of public materials, personnel, or equipment, subject to or available for a public official's, public member's, or public employee's use which does not result in additional public expense.

(B) No public official, public member, or public employee may make, participate in making, or in any way attempt to use his office, membership, or employment to influence a governmental decision in which he, a family member, an individual with whom he is associated, or a business with which he is associated has an economic interest. A public official, public member, or public employee who, in the discharge of his official responsibilities, is required to take an action or make a decision which affects an economic interest of himself, a member of his immediate family, an individual with whom he is associated, or a business with which he is associated shall:

(1) prepare a written statement describing the matter requiring action or decisions and the nature of his potential conflict of interest with respect to the action or decision;

(2) if the public official is a member of the General Assembly, he shall deliver a copy of the statement to the presiding officer of the appropriate house. The presiding officer shall have the statement printed in the appropriate journal and require that the member of

the General Assembly be excused from votes, deliberations, and other action on the matter on which a potential conflict exists;

(3) if he is a public employee, he shall furnish a copy of the statement to his superior, if any, who shall assign the matter to another employee who does not have a potential conflict of interest. If he has no immediate superior, he shall take the action prescribed by the State Ethics Commission;

(4) if he is a public official, other than a member of the General Assembly, he shall furnish a copy of the statement to the presiding officer of the governing body of any agency, commission, board, or of any county, municipality, or a political subdivision thereof, on which he serves, who shall cause the statement to be printed in the minutes and require that the member be excused from any votes, deliberations, and other actions on the matter on which the potential conflict of interest exists and shall cause the disqualification and the reasons for it to be noted in the minutes;

(5) if he is a public member, he shall furnish a copy to the presiding officer of any agency, commission, board, or of any county, municipality, or a political subdivision thereof, on which he serves, who shall cause the statement to be printed in the minutes and shall require that the member be excused from any votes, deliberations, and other actions on the matter on which the potential conflict of interest exists and shall cause such disqualification and the reasons for it to be noted in the minutes.

(C) Where a public official, public member, or public employee or a member of his immediate family holds an economic interest in a blind trust, he is not considered to have a conflict of interest with regard to matters pertaining to that economic interest, if the existence of the blind trust has been disclosed to the appropriate supervisory office.

(D) The provisions of this section do not apply to any court in the unified judicial system.

(E) When a member of the General Assembly is required by law to appear because of his business interest as an owner or officer of the business or in his official capacity as a member of the General Assembly, this section does not apply.

**C. Section 8-13-705.** Offering, giving, soliciting, or receiving anything of value to influence action of public employee, member or official, or to influence testimony of witness; exceptions; penalty for violation.

(A) A person may not, directly or indirectly, give, offer, or promise anything of value to a public official, public member, or public employee with the intent to:

- (1) influence the discharge of a public official's, public member's, or public employee's official responsibilities;
- (2) influence a public official, public member, or public employee to commit, aid in committing, collude in, or allow fraud on a governmental entity; or
- (3) induce a public official, public member, or public employee to perform or fail to perform an act in violation of the public official's, public member's, or public employee's official responsibilities.

(B) A public official, public member, or public employee may not, directly or indirectly, knowingly ask, demand, exact, solicit, seek, accept, assign, receive, or agree to receive anything of value for himself or for another person in return for being:

- (1) influenced in the discharge of his official responsibilities;
- (2) influenced to commit, aid in committing, collude in, allow fraud, or make an opportunity for the commission of fraud on a governmental entity; or
- (3) induced to perform or fail to perform an act in violation of his official responsibilities.

(C) A person may not, directly or indirectly, give, offer, or promise to give anything of value to another person with intent to influence testimony under oath or affirmation in a trial or other proceeding before:

- (1) a court;
- (2) a committee of either house or both houses of the General Assembly; or
- (3) an agency, commission, or officer authorized to hear evidence or take testimony, or with intent to influence a witness to fail to appear.

(D) A person may not, directly or indirectly, ask, demand, exact, solicit, seek, accept, assign, receive, or agree to receive anything of value in return for influencing testimony under oath or affirmation

in a trial or other proceeding before:

- (1) a court;
- (2) a committee of either house or both houses of the General Assembly; or
- (3) an agency, commission, or officer authorized to hear evidence or take testimony, or with intent to influence a witness to fail to appear.

(E) Subsections (C) and (D) of this section do not prohibit the payment or receipt of witness fees provided by law or the payment by the party on whose behalf a witness is called and receipt by a witness of the reasonable costs of travel and subsistence at trial, hearing, or proceeding, or, in the case of an expert witness, of the reasonable fee for time spent in the preparation of the opinion and in appearing or testifying.

(F) A person who violates the provisions of this section is guilty of a felony and, upon conviction, must be punished by imprisonment for not more than ten years and a fine of not more than ten thousand dollars and is permanently disqualified from being a public official or a public member. A public official, public member, or public employee who violates the provisions of this section forfeits his public office, membership, or employment.

(G) This section does not apply to political contributions unless the contributions are conditioned upon the performance of specific actions of the person accepting the contributions nor does it prohibit a parent, grandparent, or other close relative from making a gift to a child, grandchild, or other close relative for love and affection except as otherwise provided.

#### **IV. Penalties under the Ethics Reform Act's**

A. **Section 8-13-320(10)(I)** The written decision as provided for in subitem (k) may set forth an order:

(i) requiring the public official, public member, or public employee to pay a civil penalty of not more than two thousand dollars for each violation;

(ii) requiring the forfeiture of gifts, receipts, or profits, or the value thereof, obtained in violation of the chapter, voiding nonlegislative state action obtained in violation of the chapter; or

(iii) requiring a combination of subitems (i) and (ii) above, as necessary and appropriate.

B. **Section 8-13-705(G)** provides for imprisonment of not more than 10 years and fined not more than \$10,000 and that the . Permanently disqualified as public official or forfeits public employment. §8-13-705.

C. **Section 8-13-1510:** (A) Except as otherwise specifically provided in this chapter, a person required to file a report or statement under this chapter who files a late statement or report or fails to file a required statement or report must be assessed a civil penalty as follows:

(1) a fine of one hundred dollars if the statement or report is not filed within five days after the established deadline provided by law in this chapter; and

(2) after notice has been given by certified or registered mail that a required statement or report has not been filed, a fine of ten dollars per calendar day for the first ten days after notice has been given, and one hundred dollars for each additional calendar day in which the required statement or report is not filed, not exceeding five thousand dollars.

(B) After the maximum civil penalty has been levied and the required statement or report has not been filed, the person is:

(1) for a first offense, guilty of a misdemeanor triable in magistrates court and, upon conviction, must be fined not more than five hundred dollars or imprisoned not more than thirty days;

(2) for a second offense, guilty of a misdemeanor triable in magistrates court and, upon conviction, must be fined not less than two thousand five hundred dollars nor more than five thousand dollars or imprisoned not less than a mandatory minimum of thirty days;

(3) for a third or subsequent offense, guilty of a misdemeanor triable in magistrates court and, upon conviction, must be fined not more than five thousand dollars or imprisoned for not more than one year, or both.

D. **Section 8-13-780** provides that the Commission may issue a public reprimand.

V. **State Ethics Commission's website, <http://ethics.sc.gov> .**

- Electronic filing and public reporting
- Formal advisory opinions
- The Ethics Reform Act